DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY

BUFFALO DISTRICT, CORPS OF ENGINEERS 1776 NIAGARA STREET BUFFALO, NEW YORK 14207-3199

Regulatory Branch

SUBJECT: Millennium Pipeline - Department of the Army Permit Application Nos. 97-320-0003(2), 1999-00640, 199701186

January 20, 2004

Regulatory Branch

SUBJECT: Millennium Pipeline - Department of the Army Permit Application Nos. 97-320-0003(2), 1999-00640, 199701186

Mr. Richard Hall Columbia Gas Transmission Corporation 293 Court Street Binghamton, New York 13901

Dear Mr. Hall:

This pertains to your application for a Department of the Army (DA) permit for the Millennium Pipeline project, proposed to cross multiple waterways, located within the states of Pennsylvania and New York. The purpose of this letter is to address the recent decision by the U.S. Department of Commerce on the coastal zone consistency concurrence. This letter serves as a coordinated response from the Pittsburgh, Buffalo and New York Districts.

In accordance with regulations at 33 CFR 320.4(j)(1), a DA permit shall be denied where a Federal, state, or local agency has denied a required certification and/or authorization prior to final action on the DA permit. Our records indicate that the State of New York denied individual coastal zone consistency concurrence for Millennium's project on May 9, 2002, and the U.S. Secretary of Commerce upheld the State's decision on December 15, 2003. Therefore, your DA permit is hereby denied without prejudice.

The denial is without prejudice to your right to request reinstatement should you receive subsequent approval from the State. Before the Corps of Engineers can consider your project any further, you must obtain an individual coastal zone consistency concurrence from the following agency:

New York Department of State
Division of Coastal Resources and
Waterfront Revitalization
41 State Street
Albany, New York 12231-0001

If you successfully complete this process, you must then contact this office at the address listed below for guidance on proceeding with the DA permit application. If your project is modified during the coastal zone management review, you may need to furnish me with an updated application package, and a supplemental Public Notice may be required to evaluate the modification.

Please note that remaining issues that may require further evaluation include: concerns over the currently proposed Hudson River crossing at Haverstraw Bay, and the outstanding objections from the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) and the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS), particularly with regard to the impacts associated with the Haverstraw Bay crossing. If you reinstate your permit application, the Corps would resume processing your application and would attempt to resolve these issues at that time. Additional issues that would also be discussed include the finalization of the third-party compliance monitoring plan. Also note that a modification to the Water Quality Certification issued by the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation would be required.

In addition, if a considerable amount of time passes prior to the reinstatement of a permit application, the Corps may determine that a re-evaluation of aquatic resources to be impacted by the construction of the pipeline is necessary.

Please be advised that you must obtain proper Department of the Army authorization prior to proceeding with your project.

Questions pertaining to this matter should be directed to Ms. Margaret Crawford at (315) 255-8090, by writing to the following address: U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, 7413 County House Road, Auburn, New York 13021, or by e-mail at: margaret.a.crawford@usace.army.mil

Sincerely,

//S//

Jeffrey M. Hall Lieutenant Colonel, Corps of Engineers District Engineer

Enclosure

A copy of this letter has been furnished to the following:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service

Federal Energy Regulatory Commission

U.S. Department of Commerce

National Marine Fisheries Service

National Park Service

U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, Cold Regions Research and Engineering Laboratory

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

New York State Department of State

New York State Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

New York State Department of Agriculture and Markets

New York State Public Service Commission

Office of New York State Attorney General Eliot Spitzer

Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection

Pennsylvania Department of Conservation and Natural Resources

Pennsylvania Fish and Boat Commission

New York City Department of Environmental Protection

Governor George E. Pataki

Senator Charles Schumer

Senator Hilary Rodham-Clinton

Representative Jack Quinn

Representative Amo Houghton

Representative Maurice D. Hinchey

Representative Sherwood L. Boehlert

Representative Philip English

Representative Eliot Engel

Representative Nita Lowey

Representative Sue Kelly

Westchester County Executive Andrew J. Spano

SUBJECT: Millennium Pipeline - Department of the Army Permit Application Nos. 97-320-0003(2), 1999-00640, 199701186 CF:

(Note: all parties to receive copies of letter and CC list. Those parties noted with an * are also to receive a copy of Press Release and Fact Sheet.)

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 2 Attn: Jeanne Fox, Regional Administrator 290 Broadway 24th Floor New York, New York 10007-1866

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Attn: Mr. David Stilwell 3817 Luker Road Cortland, New York 13045

Federal Energy Regulatory Commission Attn: Ms. Richard Hoffman 888 First Street, N.E., Room 1A Washington, D.C. 20426

U.S. Department of Commerce Attn: Donald Evans, Secretary of Commerce 1401 Constitution Avenue, NW Washington, D.C. 20230

National Marine Fisheries Service Attn: Patricia Kurkul, Regional Administrator One Blackburn Drive Gloucester, Massachusetts 01930-2298

National Park Service Attn: Mr. Don Hamilton Upper Delaware Scenic and Recreational River RR2 Box 2428 Beach Lake, PA 18405-9737

U.S. Army Corps of Engineers ERDC-CRREL-NH Attn: James Lever 72 Lyme Road Hanover, New Hampshire 03755-1290

New York State Department of Environmental Conservation Attn: Mr. Jeff Gregg

SUBJECT: Millennium Pipeline - Department of the Army Permit Application Nos. 97-320-0003(2), 1999-00640, 199701186 50 Wolf Road Albany, New York 12233-1500

New York State Department of State Division of Coastal Resources Attn: George Stafford, Director 41 State Street Albany, New York 12231-0001

New York State Office of Parks,
Recreation and Historic Preservation
Attn: Mr. Daniel Kane
The Governor Nelson A. Rockefeller Empire State Plaza
Agency Building 1
Albany, New York 12238

State of New York
Department of Agriculture and Markets
Attn: Mr. Matthew Brower
1 Winners Circle
Albany, New York 12235

New York State Public Service Commission Attn: Nancy A. Russell, Assistant Counsel 3 Empire State Plaza Albany, New York 12223-1350

*Office of New York State Attorney General Eliot Spitzer Attn: Mr. Jim Pierney The Capitol Building Albany, New York 12224-0341

Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection Soils and Waterways, Attn: Mr. Pat Williams 230 Chestnut Street Meadville, Pennsylvania 16335

Pennsylvania Department of Conservation and Natural Resources Attn: Mr. Michael DiBerardinis P.O. Box 8767 Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17105-8767

Pennsylvania Fish and Boat Commission Attn: Mr. Ron Tibbott 450 Robinson Lane Bellefonte, Pennsylvania 16823

New York City Department of Environmental Protection Attn: Dr. William Stasiuk Deputy Commissioner SUBJECT: Millennium Pipeline - Department of the Army Permit Application Nos. 97-320-0003(2), 1999-00640, 199701186
Bureau of Water Supply,
Quality and Protection
71 Smith Avenue
Kingston, New York 12401

*Governor George E. Pataki State Capitol Albany, New York 12224

*Senator Charles Schumer

*Senator Hilary Rodham-Clinton

*Representative Jack Quinn

*Representative Amo Houghton

*Representative Maurice D. Hinchley

*Representative Sherwood L. Boehlert

*Representative Philip English

*Representative Eliot Engel 6 Gramatan Avenue Suite 205 Mt. Vernon, New York 10550 (914) 699-3646 fax

*Representative Nita Lowey 222 Mamaroneck Avenue Suite 320 White Plains, New York 10605 (914) 328-1505 fax

*Representative Sue Kelly 21 Old Main Street, Room 107 Fishkill, New York 12524 (845) 897-5800 fax

*Westchester County Executive Andrew J. Spano Michaelian Office Building White Plains, New York 10601